

Nontraumatic abdominal pain evidence project – Evidence-based Guidelines Included in the Recommendation Matrix

Mean Guideline Scores and Scaled Scores across Domains of the AGREE II Instrument

AGREE II Domain	AGREE II Domain Topics	Gans SL et al. Guideline for the diagnostic pathway in patients with acute abdominal pain . Digestive surgery. 2015;32(1):23-31.	Dillehay G, et al. Appropriate use criteria for hepatobiliary scintigraphy in abdominal pain. Reston, VA: Society of Nuclear Medicine and Molecular Imaging; 2017. p. 11.	Dahabreh IJ et al. AHRQ Comparative Effectiveness Reviews. Diagnosis of Right Lower Quadrant Pain and Suspected Acute Appendicitis . Rockville (MD): Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (US); 2015.	Diercks et al. Critical issues in the evaluation and management of emergency department patients with suspected appendicitis . 2023.	National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE). Gallstone disease . London UK: National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE); 2014.	European Association for the Study of the Liver (EASL). EASL Clinical Practice Guidelines on the prevention, diagnosis and treatment of gallstones . Journal of hepatology. 2016;65(1):146-81.	Williams et al. Updated guideline on the management of common bile duct stones (CBDs). Gut. 2017;66(5):765-82.
Total Score EXCLUDING overall assessment score		107.5	103	118.5	102.5	143	121	118
Scaled Total Score Excluding overall assessment score		61%	58%	69%	58%	87%	71%	69%
Overall Assessment Score	Rate the overall quality of the guideline (Scale of 1 to 7) NOTE: The overall assessment score is not included in the total score	4.5	4.5	5	4.5	6	5.5	5
Scope and Purpose	Domain Score	16	15.5	18	17.5	17.5	17.5	17
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	72%	69%	83%	81%	81%	81%	78%
Stakeholder Involvement	Domain Score	15	12.5	16.5	6.5	19	16.5	16
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	67%	53%	75%	19%	89%	75%	72%
Rigor of Development	Domain Score	40	39.5	43.5	36	52	41	43
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	67%	66%	74%	58%	92%	67%	73%
Clarity and Presentation	Domain Score	14.5	10	12	15.5	19	17.5	16
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	64%	39%	50%	69%	89%	81%	72%
Applicability	Domain Score	16	16	17	12	24.5	18	16
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	50%	50%	54%	33%	85%	58%	50%
Editorial Independence	Domain Score	6	9.5	11.5	8.5	11	11.5	10
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	33%	63%	79%	54%	75%	79%	67%

*Mean guidelines scores across domains of the AGREE II instrument. Each question was rated on a Likert scale with a maximum of 7 points. The scaled domain score is calculated as follows: (obtained score – minimum possible score) ÷ (maximum possible score – minimum possible score)

Mean Guideline Scores and Scaled Scores across Domains of the AGREE II Instrument

AGREE II Domain	AGREE II Domain Topics	IAP/APA evidence-based guidelines for the management of acute pancreatitis. Pancreatology. 2013;13(4 Suppl 2):e1-15.	Kiriyama et al (2013); Yokoe et al (2013); Japanese Society of Hepato-Biliary-Pancreatic Surgery. 2013. Japan: Japanese Society of Hepato-Biliary-Pancreatic Surgery; 2013.	Maung AA et al. Evaluation and management of small-bowel obstruction: An Eastern Association for the Surgery of Trauma practice management guideline. The journal of trauma and acute care surgery. 2012;73(5 Suppl 4):S362-9.	Elta et al. ACG clinical guideline: Diagnosis and management of pancreatic cysts. Am J Gastroenterol. 2018; 113(4):464-479.	Lamb et al 2019. BSG consensus guidelines on the management of inflammatory bowel disease in adults. Gut. 2019; 68(Suppl 3):s1-s106.	Ueno F et al Evidence-based clinical practice guidelines for Crohn's disease, integrated with formal consensus of experts in Japan. Journal of gastroenterology. 2013;48(1):31-72.	Brandt LJ et al. ACG clinical guideline: epidemiology, risk factors, patterns of presentation, diagnosis, and management of colon ischemia (CI). The American journal of gastroenterology. 2015;110(1):18-44;
Total Score EXCLUDING overall assessment score		104	122	94.5	98.5	101	116	94.5
Scaled Total Score Excluding overall assessment score		59%	72%	52%	55%	57%	67%	52%
Overall Assessment Score	Rate the overall quality of the guideline (Scale of 1 to 7) NOTE: The overall assessment score is not included in the total score	4.5	5.5	4	4.5	4.5	5	4
Scope and Purpose	Domain Score	16	16.5	12	17.5	16	19	14
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	72%	75%	50%	81%	72%	89%	61%
Stakeholder Involvement	Domain Score	10	16	8.5	10.5	11	16	6.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	39%	72%	31%	42%	44%	72%	19%
Rigor of Development	Domain Score	41	43.5	36.5	32.5	38	39	37
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	69%	74%	59%	51%	63%	65%	60%
Clarity and Presentation	Domain Score	15	18	17	17	14	16	17.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	67%	83%	78%	78%	61%	72%	81%
Applicability	Domain Score	17	18.5	12	12	14	16	9
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	54%	60%	33%	33%	42%	50%	21%
Editorial Independence	Domain Score	4	9.5	8.5	9	8	10	10.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	17%	63%	54%	58%	50%	67%	71%

*Mean guidelines scores across domains of the AGREE II instrument. Each question was rated on a Likert scale with a maximum of 7 points. The scaled domain score is calculated as follows: (obtained score – minimum possible score) ÷ (maximum possible score – minimum possible score)

Mean Guideline Scores and Scaled Scores across Domains of the AGREE II Instrument

AGREE II Domain	AGREE II Domain Topics	Bjorck M et al Management of the Diseases of Mesenteric Arteries and Veins: Clinical Practice Guidelines of the European Society of Vascular Surgery (ESVS). Eur J Vasc Endovasc Surg 2017; 53(4):460-510.	Tilsed JV et al. ESTES guidelines: acute mesenteric ischaemia . Eur J Trauma Emerg Surg. 2016 Apr;42(2):253-270.	Lichtenstein GR et al. ACG Clinical Guideline: Management of Crohn's Disease in Adults. Am J Gastroenterol. 2018;113(4):481-517.	Chaikof EL et al. The Society for Vascular Surgery practice guidelines on the care of patients with an abdominal aortic aneurysm . Journal of Vascular Surgery. 2018;67(1):2-77.e2.	Scheirey et al [ACR] 2018. ACR Appropriateness Criteria®. Acute nonlocalized abdominal pain .	Earle et al 2016. SAGES Guidelines Committee. Guidelines for laparoscopic ventral hernia repair. Surg Endosc. 2016; 30(8):3163-3183.	Hindman et al [ACR] 2018. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Jaundice .
Total Score EXCLUDING overall assessment score		111	96	104	116	103	101	96
Scaled Total Score Excluding overall assessment score		64%	53%	59%	67%	58%	57%	53%
Overall Assessment Score	Rate the overall quality of the guideline (Scale of 1 to 7) NOTE: The overall assessment score is not included in the total score	5	4	4.5	5	4.5	4.5	4
Scope and Purpose	Domain Score	14.5	15	15	16	15	16	11
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	64%	67%	67%	72%	67%	72%	44%
Stakeholder Involvement	Domain Score	14	8	13	14	12	8	12
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	61%	28%	56%	61%	50%	28%	50%
Rigor of Development	Domain Score	39.5	32	33.5	38.5	34.5	36	33
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	66%	50%	53%	64%	55%	58%	52%
Clarity and Presentation	Domain Score	16.5	16	14.5	17	18	16	19
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	75%	72%	64%	78%	83%	72%	89%
Applicability	Domain Score	15.5	15	17	20.5	15.5	17	14
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	48%	46%	54%	69%	48%	54%	42%
Editorial Independence	Domain Score	11	10	11	10	8	8	7
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	75%	67%	75%	67%	50%	50%	42%

*Mean guidelines scores across domains of the AGREE II instrument. Each question was rated on a Likert scale with a maximum of 7 points. The scaled domain score is calculated as follows: (obtained score – minimum possible score) ÷ (maximum possible score – minimum possible score)

Mean Guideline Scores and Scaled Scores across Domains of the AGREE II Instrument

AGREE II Domain	AGREE II Domain Topics	Porter et al [ACR] 2019. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Acute pancreatitis.	Kambadakone et al [ACR] 2022. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Right lower quadrant pain.	Weinstein et al [ACR] 2023. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Left lower quadrant pain.	Chang et al [ACR] 2019. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Suspected small-bowel obstruction.	Kim et al [ACR] 2019. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Crohn disease.	Ginsburg et al [ACR] 2018. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Mesenteric ischemia.	Francois et al [ACR] 2017. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Abdominal aortic aneurysm: Interventional planning and follow-up.
Total Score EXCLUDING overall assessment score		99	109	103.5	94	97	107.5	109.5
Scaled Total Score Excluding overall assessment score		55%	62%	58%	51%	54%	61%	63%
Overall Assessment Score	Rate the overall quality of the guideline (Scale of 1 to 7) NOTE: The overall assessment score is not included in the total score	4.5	4.5	4.5	4	4	4.5	5
Scope and Purpose	Domain Score	11	16	14	10	11	14.5	14
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	44%	72%	61%	39%	44%	64%	61%
Stakeholder Involvement	Domain Score	12	14	11	13	12	13	14
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	50%	61%	44%	56%	50%	56%	61%
Rigor of Development	Domain Score	34	36.5	40.5	34	34	37.5	38.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	54%	59%	68%	54%	54%	61%	64%
Clarity and Presentation	Domain Score	21	17.5	17.5	19	19	17.5	18
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	100%	81%	81%	89%	89%	81%	83%
Applicability	Domain Score	14	17.5	11	14	14	17.5	16.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	42%	56%	29%	42%	42%	56%	52%
Editorial Independence	Domain Score	7	7.5	9.5	6	7	7.5	8.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	42%	46%	63%	33%	42%	46%	54%

*Mean guidelines scores across domains of the AGREE II instrument. Each question was rated on a Likert scale with a maximum of 7 points. The scaled domain score is calculated as follows: (obtained score – minimum possible score) ÷ (maximum possible score – minimum possible score)

Mean Guideline Scores and Scaled Scores across Domains of the AGREE II Instrument

AGREE II Domain	AGREE II Domain Topics	Russo et al [ACR] 2023. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Right upper quadrant pain.	Gardner et al 2020. ACG clinical guideline: chronic pancreatitis. Am J Gastroenterol. 2020; 115(3):322-339.	Hall et al 2020. The American Society of Colon and Rectal Surgeons clinical practice guidelines for the treatment of left-sided colonic diverticulitis. Dis Colon Rectum; 63(6):728-747.	National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE). 2019. Diverticular disease: diagnosis and management.	Wanhainen et al 2019. European Society for Vascular Surgery (ESVS) 2019 clinical practice guidelines on the management of abdominal aorto-iliac artery aneurysms. Eur J Vasc Endovasc Surg. 2019; 57(1):8-93.	National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE). 2020. Abdominal aortic aneurysm: diagnosis and management.	National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE). 2018. Pancreatitis.
Total Score EXCLUDING overall assessment score		104.5	94	116	138	115	141	144.5
Scaled Total Score Excluding overall assessment score		59%	51%	67%	83%	67%	86%	88%
Overall Assessment Score	Rate the overall quality of the guideline (Scale of 1 to 7) NOTE: The overall assessment score is not included in the total score	4.5	4	5	6	5	6	6.5
Scope and Purpose	Domain Score	15	14	18	21	18.5	14.5	18
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	67%	61%	83%	100%	86%	64%	83%
Stakeholder Involvement	Domain Score	11	11	14	18	17	19.5	18.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	44%	44%	61%	83%	78%	92%	86%
Rigor of Development	Domain Score	41	31	42	49	34	52.5	52
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	69%	48%	71%	85%	54%	93%	92%
Clarity and Presentation	Domain Score	17	14	19.5	19	18.5	18	19
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	78%	61%	92%	89%	86%	83%	89%
Applicability	Domain Score	11	16	12.5	23	20	25.5	26
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	29%	50%	35%	79%	67%	90%	92%
Editorial Independence	Domain Score	9.5	7	10	8	7	11	11
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	63%	42%	67%	50%	42%	75%	75%

*Mean guidelines scores across domains of the AGREE II instrument. Each question was rated on a Likert scale with a maximum of 7 points. The scaled domain score is calculated as follows: (obtained score – minimum possible score) ÷ (maximum possible score – minimum possible score)

Mean Guideline Scores and Scaled Scores across Domains of the AGREE II Instrument

AGREE II Domain	AGREE II Domain Topics	Alavi et al. ASCRS clinical practice guidelines for the management of colonic volvulus and acute colonic pseudo-obstruction . Dis Colon Rectum. 2021; 64(9):1046-1057.	Chaikof et al. Society for Vascular Surgery practice guidelines on the care of patients with an abdominal aortic aneurysm . J Vasc Surg. 2018; 67(1):2-77.	Chaikof et al. The care of patients with abdominal aortic aneurysm : The Society for Vascular Surgery practice guidelines. J Vasc Surg. 2009; 50(4 Suppl):S2-S49.	Conwell et al. American Pancreatic Association Practice Guidelines in chronic pancreatitis . Pancreas. 2014; 43(8):1143-1162.	Buxbaum et al. ASGE guideline on the role of endoscopy in the evaluation and management of choledocholithiasis . Gastrointest Endos. 2019; 89(6):1075-1105.	Crockett et al. AGA Institute guideline on initial management of acute pancreatitis . Gastroenterology. 2018; 154(4):1096-1101.	EASL clinical practice guidelines. The diagnosis and management of patients with primary biliary cholangitis . J Hepatol. 2017; 67(1):145-172.
Total Score EXCLUDING overall assessment score		111	110.5	92.5	91	111	107	103.5
Scaled Total Score Excluding overall assessment score		64%	63%	50%	49%	64%	61%	58%
Overall Assessment Score	Rate the overall quality of the guideline (Scale of 1 to 7) NOTE: The overall assessment score is not included in the total score	5	5	4	4	5	4.5	4.5
Scope and Purpose	Domain Score	16	14.5	15	15	16.5	18	19
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	72%	64%	67%	57%	75%	83%	89%
Stakeholder Involvement	Domain Score	14	13.5	11.5	12	13.5	13.5	10
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	61%	58%	47%	50%	58%	58%	39%
Rigor of Development	Domain Score	42	40.5	25.5	28	39.5	36	34.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	71%	68%	36%	42%	66%	58%	55%
Clarity and Presentation	Domain Score	18.5	17	17	14	18	16.5	17
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	86%	78%	78%	61%	83%	75%	78%
Applicability	Domain Score	11.5	14.5	16	13	13	13.5	13.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	31%	44%	50%	38%	38%	40%	40%
Editorial Independence	Domain Score	9	10.5	7.5	9	10.5	9.5	9.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	58%	71%	46%	58%	71%	63%	63%

*Mean guidelines scores across domains of the AGREE II instrument. Each question was rated on a Likert scale with a maximum of 7 points. The scaled domain score is calculated as follows: (obtained score – minimum possible score) ÷ (maximum possible score – minimum possible score)

Mean Guideline Scores and Scaled Scores across Domains of the AGREE II Instrument

AGREE II Domain	AGREE II Domain Topics	Huber et al. Chronic mesenteric ischemia: Clinical practice guidelines from the SVS. J Vasc Surg. 2021; 73(1S):87S:115S.	Garcia et al. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Hernia. 2022.	Qaseem et al. Diagnosis and management of acute left-sided colonic diverticulitis: A clinical guideline from the ACP. Ann Intern Med. 2022; 175(3):399-415.	Vij et al. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Epigastric Pain. 2021.	Wang et al. ACR Appropriateness Criteria® Pulsatile Abdominal Mass, Suspected Abdominal Aortic Aneurysm. 2023.
Total Score EXCLUDING overall assessment score		98.5	97	124	98	103.5
Scaled Total Score Excluding overall assessment score		55%	54%	73%	54%	58%
Overall Assessment Score	Rate the overall quality of the guideline (Scale of 1 to 7) NOTE: The overall assessment score is not included in the total score	4.5	4	5.5	4.5	4.5
Scope and Purpose	Domain Score	16	12	17	10.5	14.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	72%	50%	78%	42%	64%
Stakeholder Involvement	Domain Score	12.5	11	14	11	11
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	53%	44%	61%	44%	44%
Rigor of Development	Domain Score	32.5	38.5	43.5	40	41
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	51%	64%	74%	67%	69%
Clarity and Presentation	Domain Score	16.5	15	18.5	16	16.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	75%	67%	86%	72%	75%
Applicability	Domain Score	13.5	11	19	11	11
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	40%	29%	63%	29%	29%
Editorial Independence	Domain Score	7.5	9.5	12	9.5	9.5
	Scaled Domain Score Percentage	46%	63%	83%	63%	63%

*Mean guidelines scores across domains of the AGREE II instrument. Each question was rated on a Likert scale with a maximum of 7 points. The scaled domain score is calculated as follows: (obtained score – minimum possible score) ÷ (maximum possible score – minimum possible score)